Benefit Year 2018 High-Cost Risk Pool (HCRP) Audit Report for

Celtic Insurance Company, FL (Celtic)
HIOS Issuer ID 21663

April 19, 2022

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY ..... 3
II. HIGH-COST RISK POOL PAYMENT AUDIT ..... 6
A. BACKGROUND, OBJECTIVES, SCOPE, and METHODOLOGY ..... 6
B. RESULTS OF REVIEW ..... 8
C. FINDINGS ..... 11
D. OBSERVATIONS ..... 12
III.ISSUER MANAGEMENT RESPONSES ..... 14
Appendix 1 - Issuer Management Response ..... 15
Appendix 2 - Applicable Federal Regulations ..... 16
Appendix 3 - Acronyms ..... 21
Appendix 4 - Audit Procedure Description, Criteria, and Effect ..... 22

## I. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The 2018 High-Cost Risk Pool (HCRP) Audit Report is an assessment of Celtic Insurance Company, FL's (Celtic) compliance with the applicable federal requirements related to benefit year (BY) 2018 payments made to Celtic under HCRP, part of the HHS-operated Risk Adjustment (RA) program established under section 1343 of the Patient Protection and Affordable Care Act (ACA) ${ }^{1}$ and implementing regulations. ${ }^{2,3}$ This report details the audit procedures ${ }^{4}$ and the resulting findings and/or observations for the BY 2018 HCRP audit of Celtic.

## Background

Celtic, HIOS Issuer ID (21663), is a health insurance issuer that received BY 2018 HCRP payments ${ }^{5}$ consistent with the BY 2018 national HCRP payment parameters. ${ }^{6}$ Celtic submitted enrollment (including premium), medical claims, and pharmacy claims data to its External Data Gathering Environment (EDGE) Server for calculation of the BY 2018 HCRP payments. The payments are reflected in the issuer's 2018 EDGE High Cost Risk Pool Detailed Enrollee (HCRPDE) Report. This issuer's total BY 2018 HCRP payments were \$3,111,407.14.

## Audits to Determine Compliance with the Federal HCRP Payment Requirements

Under 45 C.F.R. § 153.620(c), the Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) may audit issuers to assess compliance with applicable federal requirements related to the HHS-operated RA program, including the HCRP. The Centers for Medicare \& Medicaid Services (CMS), on behalf of HHS, operates the RA program and conducted these audits in pursuit of the following goals:

[^0]- Safeguard federal funds;
- Instill confidence amongst regulated entities and stakeholders concerning quality, soundness, and robustness of data;
- Evaluate health insurance issuers' compliance with applicable federal RA program requirements; and
- Develop a successful and coordinated HCRP-based audit program that maximizes resources.

This audit is part of CMS's program to validate the BY 2018 enrollee-level enrollment (including premium) and claims data submitted to the issuer's EDGE server by April 30, 2019, ${ }^{7}$ and to analyze the issuer's controls and policies related to BY 2018 HCRP payments. Additional HCRP payments will not be provided for claims identified during the course of this HCRP audit that are not reflected in the BY 2018 HCRPDE Report. ${ }^{8}$

CMS findings and observations for the BY 2018 HCRP payments made to Celtic are documented below.

- Finding: Results from cases of confirmed non-compliance or discovery of evidence suggesting non-compliance with applicable federal requirements related to HCRP payments, which require a recoupment of HCRP payments.
- Example: Claim level discrepancies identified within the issuer's claims data extract and the issuer's BY 2018 HCRPDE Report, associated with an HCRP payment enrollee, that result in a recoupment of HCRP payments.
- Observation: Results from the identification of areas for improvement when there is no evidence of actual non-compliance with applicable federal requirements related to HCRP payments or when there may be evidence of non-compliance with applicable federal requirements related to HCRP payments that does not require recoupment of HCRP payments.
- Example: Claim level discrepancies identified within the issuer's claims data extract and the issuer's BY 2018 HCRPDE Report, associated with HCRP payment enrollees where the claim adjustment would not result in a recoupment of HCRP payments.
- Example: Premium discrepancies identified within the issuer's premium data extract and the issuer's BY 2018 EDGE server submissions.


## Results of Review

CMS identified one (1) finding and one (1) observation during Celtic's BY 2018 HCRP audit. The results of the BY 2018 HCRP program audit do not require recoupment of amounts the issuer received for BY 2018 HCRP payments. The results of the one (1) audit finding resulted in a total of $\$ 264.81$ paid claim differences. All issuers' paid claims amounts, with the audit corrections applied, were aggregated for each enrollee, then the HCRP payment parameters were applied to recalculate the issuer's BY 2018 HCRP payments in the applicable national high-cost

[^1]risk pools. ${ }^{9,10}$ As a result, based on the findings identified in this report, a total recoupment payment is due to HHS of $\$ 158.88$ for the BY 2018 HCRP payments, reflecting a recoupment of $\$ 158.88$ for the individual market national high-cost risk pool and $\$ 0.00$ for the BY 2018 HCRP payments for the small group market national high-cost risk pool. If finalized, HHS will recoup this amount(s) as part of the next available monthly payment cycle consistent with applicable federal regulations. ${ }^{11}$

The result of the one (1) observation does not require a recoupment of the issuer's BY 2018 HCRP payments. In some instances, an observation may also affect an enrollee who received an HCRP payment but not result in an impact to the HCRP payment for that enrollee (e.g., the issuer's aggregated paid claims for the enrollee, after correcting the observation and application of the BY 2018 HCRP payment parameters, results in the same or a larger ${ }^{12}$ HCRP payment for the enrollee).

Please refer to Sections II.C and II.D below for details on the finding and observation noted above.

[^2]
## II. HIGH-COST RISK POOL PAYMENT AUDIT

## A. BACKGROUND, OBJECTIVES, SCOPE, and METHODOLOGY

## 1. Background

HHS has authority to conduct audits to confirm successful implementation of, and adherence to, the applicable federal requirements related to the HHS-operated RA program, including the HCRP. ${ }^{13}$ As such, CMS, on behalf of HHS, established this audit program.
Section 1343 of the ACA established the RA program to stabilize premiums in the individual and small group markets inside and outside of the Exchanges. Consistent with section 1321(c) of the ACA, HHS is responsible for operating the RA program in any state that fails to do so. CMS, on behalf of HHS, operated the RA program in all 50 states and the District of Columbia for the BY 2018.

HHS established the HCRP as part of the HHS RA methodology beginning with BY 2018. ${ }^{14}$ The HCRP calculations under the HHS RA methodology involve two national risk pools - one for the individual market (including catastrophic and non-catastrophic plans, and merged market plans), and another for the small group market. ${ }^{15}$ The HCRP helps ensure that risk adjustment transfers better reflect average actuarial risk, while also stabilizing premiums and reimbursing issuers for a portion of costs for exceptionally high-cost enrollees. Under HCRP, issuers of RA covered plans receive payments for a percentage of covered claims (coinsurance rate) above the attachment point. For the BY 2018 HCRP, the attachment point was $\$ 1,000,000$ and the coinsurance rate was $60 \% .{ }^{16}$ The HCRP also collects a percent of all premium charges by national market risk pool to fund HCRP payments to issuers of RA covered plans in the respective national market risk pool.
HHS implemented a distributed data collection (DDC) approach where issuers of RA covered plans are required to establish EDGE servers to make data accessible to support the calculation of transfers under the HHS-operated RA program. ${ }^{17}$ Issuers are generally required to submit enrollee (including premium) and claims data to their EDGE servers by April $30^{\text {th }}$ of the year following the applicable benefit year. ${ }^{18}$ Non-orphan claims (i.e., those that are linked to enrollees in a valid individual and small group (including merged) market RA covered plan) were selected for the HCRP calculation and considered as a request for payment pursuant to 45 C.F.R. § 153.620. Each issuer's EDGE server calculated the issuer's HCRP payment for the applicable national market risk pool, while the EDGE Calculation Module (ECM), a CMS internal system, calculated the amount of each issuer's HCRP charge for the applicable national market risk pool.

CMS established audit protocols to assess health insurance issuers' compliance with the regulations governing the HHS-operated RA program, including HCRP, such as:

[^3]- 45 C.F.R. § 153.610: Risk Adjustment issuer requirements;
- 45 C.F.R. § 153.620: Compliance with risk adjustment standards; and
- 45 C.F.R. § 153.700: Distributed data environment.

Please refer to Appendix 2 for further details on these regulations.

## 2. Objectives

The objectives of this audit are to:
(1) Evaluate enrollment (including premium) and claims files on the issuer's EDGE server against applicable federal requirements related to HCRP payments for compliance and completeness;
(2) Assess validity and compliance of issuer-submitted plan reference data and associated enrollee data with applicable federal requirements related to HCRP payments;
(3) Evaluate whether issuer supporting data and documentation confirms the information in the BY 2018 HCRPDE Report ${ }^{19}$ and BY 2018 Enrollment File data at the enrollee and subscriber level;
(4) Evaluate accuracy of the issuer's HCRP payments, as calculated by the EDGE server, ${ }^{20}$ in instances where there is a deviation between the issuer's audit data and the data on the issuer's EDGE server;
(5) Assess issuer controls, policies, and procedures surrounding HCRP data submissions to the issuer's EDGE server; and
(6) Assess the issuer's compliance with the maintenance of records requirements in 45 C.F.R. § 153.620(b) (i.e., 10 years of file retention).

## 3. Scope and Methodology

CMS selected Celtic for an audit to assess the issuer's compliance with the federal requirements related to BY 2018 HCRP payments. CMS evaluated Celtic's information and activities related to the BY 2018 (January 1, 2018 through December 31, 2018) enrollee (including premium) and claim-level data submitted to the issuer's EDGE server as of April 30, 2019, to verify the BY 2018 HCRP payments received.
CMS sent Celtic an electronic letter on April 12, 2021, to notify them of this audit. CMS's audit contractor sent a follow-up letter to Celtic on April 14, 2021, that identified the data and other requirements related to conducting the audit. CMS's audit contractor reviewed Celtic's documentation, including issuer-provided data extracts, and used CMS's applicable audit procedures to assess compliance with applicable federal HCRP program rules and regulations.
CMS's audit contractor applied CMS's audit protocols to identify findings and observations. The contractor performed audit procedures on data and information for $100 \%$ of known on-Exchange and off-Exchange enrollees in RA covered plans who received BY 2018 HCRP payments, as well as a random selection of subscribers to evaluate premiums. (Note: Any discrepancies identified as a result of the premium validations will result in an observation and therefore will

[^4]not have financial impact as a result of these audits). CMS's audit procedures included the following ${ }^{21}$ :
(1) Unreconciled Claims Review: Compare the unique claim IDs included in the issuer's BY 2018 HCRPDE Report to the unique claim IDs included in the issuer's claims data extract to determine existence.
(2) RA Covered Plan Review: Compare the issuer's claims in the claims data extract to those in the BY 2018 HCRPDE Report to validate whether the claim was paid by an RA covered plan and matches the plan ID reported in the issuer's BY 2018 HCRPDE Report.
(3) Claim Coverage Period Validation: Compare the issuer's claims in the claims data extract to the coverage period in the BY 2018 EDGE Enrollment File to determine whether the claim start date is within the enrollee's coverage period.
(4) Paid Claim Amount Validation: Review the issuer's claims in the claims data extract to validate the paid claim amount matches the paid claim amount in the issuer's BY 2018 HCRPDE Report.
(5) BY 2018 Cross Year Claim Validation: Review the issuer's claims end dates in the claims data extract to validate whether cross year claims fell within BY 2018 and were not from the prior or subsequent benefit years.
(6) Duplicate Claim Validation: Review the issuer's claims in the claims data extract and determine if duplicate claims were reported to the EDGE server.
(7) Enrollee Validation: Compare the unique enrollees and related claims included in the issuer's BY 2018 HCRPDE Report to the unique enrollee IDs and related claims included in the issuer's claims data extract to determine the accuracy of enrollees submitted to the EDGE server.
(8) Premium Effectuation Validation: Compare the issuer's initial premium payment documentation to the issuer's premium data extract to validate the accuracy of binder payment amount and appropriate effectuation.
(9) Premium Amount Validation: Compare the premium information in the issuer's premium data extract to premium information in the issuer's BY 2018 EDGE Enrollment File to validate the accuracy of the premium data reported to the EDGE server for all months of enrollment.
(10) Issuer Policies and Procedures Review: Determine whether the issuer's policies and procedures comply with applicable CMS rules, regulations, and policies related to HCRP.
(11) Issuer Attestation Review: Validate that the issuer provided a completed attestation signed by the Chief Executive Officer (CEO), Chief Financial Officer (CFO) or other authorized official who has reviewed the documentation submitted for this audit. This procedure is performed to substantiate the accuracy of the documentation submitted during the audit process and does not result in a finding or observation for the issuer.

## B. RESULTS OF REVIEW

CMS assessed Celtic's compliance with applicable federal requirements related to the HCRP that is part of the HHS-operated RA program, using the following procedures: Unreconciled Claims Review, RA Covered Plan Review, Claim Coverage Period Validation, Paid Claim Amount

[^5]Validation, BY 2018 Cross Year Claim Validation, Duplicate Claim Validation, Enrollee Validation, Premium Effectuation Validation, Premium Amount Validation, Issuer Policies and Procedures Review, and Issuer Attestation Review. Below are the results of this review. ${ }^{22}$

## (1) Unreconciled Claims Review

No findings resulted from the review of Celtic's claims data extract to determine if the claims reported on the BY 2018 HCRPDE Report existed in the claims data extract.

## (2) RA Covered Plan Review

No findings and no observations resulted from the review of Celtic's claims data extract to determine if the enrollee's plan ID matched the corresponding enrollee's plan ID reported in the issuer's BY 2018 HCRPDE Report and if the claim was paid by an RA covered plan.

## (3) Claim Coverage Period Validation

No findings resulted from the review of Celtic's claims data extract to determine whether the claim start date fell within the enrollee's coverage period.

## (4) Paid Claim Amount Validation

One (1) finding and no observations resulted from the review of Celtic's claims data extract to determine if the claim paid amount matched the corresponding claim paid amount in the issuer's BY 2018 HCRPDE Report. Please refer to Finding No. 1 included in Section II.C below for details on the finding and observation.

## (5) BY 2018 Cross Year Claim Validation

No findings resulted from the review of Celtic's claims data extract to identify cross year claims and determine if the service end date of claims fell within BY 2018.

## (6) Duplicate Claim Validation

No findings resulted from the review of Celtic's claims data extract to determine if claims were reported more than once on the EDGE server.

## (7) Enrollee Validation

No findings resulted from the review of Celtic's claims data extract to determine if the enrollee and related claims included in the issuer's claims data extract matches the enrollee associated with the applicable claim on the EDGE server.

## (8) Premium Effectuation Validation

No observations resulted from the review of Celtic's initial premium documentation to determine if the first month binder payment was received and/or differences were identified for the first month of enrollment in the issuer's premium data extract.

## (9) Premium Amount Validation

No observations resulted from the review of Celtic's premium data extract to determine if the issuer's premium amount matched the corresponding premium amount in the issuer's BY 2018

[^6]EDGE Enrollment File.

## (10) Issuer Policies and Procedures Review

One (1) observation resulted from the review of Celtic's HCRP policies and procedures to determine compliance with applicable CMS rules, regulations, and policies. Please refer to Observation No. 1 included in Section II.D below for details on the observation.

## (11) Issuer Attestation Review

No observations result from the review of Celtic's Attestation to validate that the issuer provided a completed attestation signed by the Chief Executive Officer (CEO), Chief Financial Officer (CFO) or other authorized official who has reviewed the documentation submitted for this audit.

## C. FINDINGS

A finding results from cases of confirmed non-compliance or discovery of evidence suggesting non-compliance with applicable federal requirements related to HCRP payments, which requires a recoupment of HCRP payments. For BY 2018, an enrollee must have had claims paid by the issuer in an amount that exceeds the attachment point of $\$ 1,000,000$ to be eligible for an HCRP payment. The paid amounts ${ }^{23}$ reported in the issuer's BY 2018 HCRPDE Report, the 2018 Coinsurance rate of $60 \%$, as well as the paid claim amount differences identified from the claimlevel audit procedures, were considered for purposes of determining the financial impact of the findings in Celtic's BY 2018 HCRP audit. Please refer to the Findings Summary Results table below to view the aggregated amount of paid claim differences associated with each audit procedure.

## Findings Summary Results:

| Finding No. | Claim Level Procedure | Individual Market |  | Small Group Market |  | Total |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | Total Count of Claims | Total <br> Claim <br> Level Differences | Total Count of Claims | Total <br> Claim <br> Level Differences | Total Count of Claims | Total <br> Claim <br> Level Differences |
| Finding No. 1 | Paid Claim <br> Amount Validation | 1 | \$264.81 | 0 | \$0.00 | 1 | \$264.81 |
| Total Paid Claim Differences |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | \$264.81 |

Based on the claim-level audit procedures performed, one (1) finding was identified for enrollees associated with a BY 2018 HCRP payment. These claim-level procedures resulted in a total of $\$ 264.81$ paid claim amount differences, and the differences were further aggregated at the enrollee and national market risk pool level for final recalculation of the issuer's BY 2018 HCRP payments, which resulted in a total financial impact of $\$ 158.88$. Please refer to the Findings Summary Results table above to view the aggregated amount of paid claim differences associated with each audit procedure used for calculating the "Total Financial Impact" amount shown in the table below.

[^7]
## Financial Impact Summary Results:

|  | Total <br> Individual <br> Market <br> Payment <br> Amount | Total Small <br> Group Market <br> Payment <br> Amount | Total HCRP <br> Payment <br> Amount |
| :--- | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| Total HCRP Payments per <br> Celtic's BY 2018 HCRPDE <br> Report | $\$ 3,111,407.14$ | $\$ 0.00$ | $\$ 3,111,407.14$ |
| Total HCRP Payments as <br> Recalculated | $\$ 3,111,248.26$ | $\$ 0.00$ | $\$ 3,111,248.26$ |
| Total Financial Impact ${ }^{\mathbf{2 4}}$ | $\$ 158.88$ | $\$ 0.00$ | $\$ 158.88$ |

The financial impact of the one (1) finding is subject to recoupment by HHS in the amount of $\$ 158.88$, reflecting a recoupment of $\$ 158.88$ for the individual market national high-cost risk pool and $\$ 0.00$ for the for the small group market national high-cost risk pool.

Please see Appendix 4 for more information on each procedure's description, criteria, and effect.

## D. OBSERVATIONS

An observation results from the identification of areas for improvement when there is no evidence of actual non-compliance with applicable federal requirements related to HCRP payments or when there may be evidence of non-compliance with applicable federal requirements related to HCRP payments that does not require recoupment of HCRP payments. CMS is making Celtic's management aware of these areas by bringing the identified observations to their attention.

Based on the claim-level audit procedures performed, no observations were identified for enrollees associated with a BY 2018 HCRP payment. Based on the premium-related audit procedures performed, no observations were identified for subscribers with enrollment in BY 2018. Additionally, one (1) observation was identified for the Issuer Policies and Procedures Review. Please see the Observations Summary Results table below for more information on the observation identified.

[^8]
## Observations Summary Results:

| Observation No. | Claim Level Procedure | Individual Market | Small Group Market | Total |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | Total Count of Claims | Total Count of Claims | Total Count of Claims |
| No observations noted. |  |  |  |  |
| Observation No. | Premium <br> Procedure | Total Count of Subscribers | Total Count of Subscribers | Total Count of Subscribers |
| No observations noted. |  |  |  |  |
| Observation No. | Policies and Procedures |  |  |  |
| Observation No. 1 | Issuer Policies and Procedures Review |  |  |  |

## III. ISSUER MANAGEMENT RESPONSES

Celtic's completed attached Appendix 1 - Issuer Management Response to Financial Recoupment Adjustment (Appendix 1), is due within thirty (30) calendar days from the date of this draft audit report. If CMS does not receive Celtic's management response within this timeframe, we will assume your management's agreement and issue the final audit report.

## Agreement

If Celtic's management agrees with the reported finding(s), observation(s), and recoupment amount (if applicable) the issuer should initial "Agree", sign, and submit the attached Appendix 1.

## Disagreement

If Celtic's management disagrees with the reported finding(s), observation(s), and recoupment amount (if applicable) and requests a review of additional information that may impact the results of the audit, the issuer should initial "Disagree" and sign the attached Appendix 1. If this option is selected, CMS will consider this draft only a preliminary audit report and you must provide a written explanation with any such additional documentation within thirty (30) calendar days of the date of this draft audit report along with a completed Appendix 1. CMS will review the written explanation and supporting documentation submitted as part of your response to this report to determine if the report can be amended in a mutually acceptable manner. CMS maintains discretion to determine whether amendments to the report are appropriate. Your response(s) to this report will be included in the final published audit report.

Regardless of whether the issuer agrees or disagrees with the reported finding(s) and observation(s), Celtic's management should review and return the draft audit report, including completed Appendix 1, within thirty (30) calendar days from the date of this draft audit report. Review of this draft report is the final opportunity to provide information to correct any inaccuracies before it is finalized. CMS will provide Celtic a copy of the final audit report and publish the final report on the Center for Consumer Information and Insurance Oversight (CCIIO) website ${ }^{25}$, including the recoupment amount(s) (if applicable) along with an updated Appendix 1, after receipt of Celtic's management's response. CMS will finalize and process the recoupment amount(s) (if applicable) consistent with 45 C.F.R. § 156.1210 and the netting regulation at 45 C.F.R. § 156.1215 in the next available monthly payment cycle. If all or part of the recoupment amount(s) is unable to be netted, the remaining amount is a determination of a debt that is owed to the federal government. See 45 C.F.R. § 156.1215(c).

[^9]
## Appendix 1 - Issuer Management Response

Issuer ID: 21663
Issuer Name: Celtic Insurance Company, FL
Issuer Address:
The undersigned Chief Executive Officer (CEO), Chief Financial Officer (CFO), or other individual with authority to legally and financially bind this issuer has reviewed the information included in the Audit Report of the issuer's compliance with applicable federal requirements related to HCRP payments made through the HHS-RA program for BY 2018. This audit resulted in a total recoupment amount of $\$ 158.88$, reflecting a recoupment of $\$ 158.88$ for the individual market national high-cost risk pool and $\$ 0.00$ for the small group market national high-cost risk pool.

## Agreement/Disagreement

(INITIAL __K_KC Agrees with the audit recoupment amount above for this issuer's BY 2018 HCRP payment audit, confirming the audit finding and observation, as such this report will be considered a final audit report and will be published. If this option is selected, you must return this response within 30 calendar days of the date of this draft audit report.

## Or

(INITIAL)___ Disagrees and requests a review of additional information that may impact the audit finding, observation, and recoupment amount (if applicable) resulting from the BY 2018 HCRP payment audit. If a review is requested, CMS will consider this draft only a preliminary audit report. If this option is selected, you must provide a written explanation with any additional support documentation that may impact the results of the audit when you return this response within 30 calendar days of the date of this draft audit report. CMS will review the written explanation and any supporting documentation submitted as part of your response to this report to determine if the report can be amended in a mutually acceptable manner. CMS maintains discretion to determine whether amendments to the report are appropriate. Your response(s) to this report will be included in the final published audit report.

Signed:

(Signature of authorized person acting on behalf of the issuer)

Printed Name: $\qquad$
(Print name of signature)
Title: President Ambetter Health
(Title of authorized person acting on behalf of the issuer)

Telephone Number: 314-445-0011
(Direct Telephone Number)

Date: $\quad$ 5/16/2022

## Appendix 2 - Applicable Federal Regulations

The following table outlines select federal regulatory requirements related to HCRP payments applicable to these audits.
\(\left.\left.\left.$$
\begin{array}{|l|l|}\hline \text { Regulation } & \text { Guidance } \\
\hline 45 \text { C.F.R § } 153.20 \text { - Definitions } & \begin{array}{l}\text { Risk adjustment covered plan means, for the purpose of the } \\
\text { risk adjustment program, any health insurance coverage offered } \\
\text { in the individual or small group market with the exception of } \\
\text { grandfathered health plans, group health insurance coverage } \\
\text { described in § 146.145(b) of this subchapter, individual health } \\
\text { insurance coverage described in § 148.220 of this subchapter, } \\
\text { and any plan determined not to be a risk adjustment covered } \\
\text { plan in the applicable Federally certified risk adjustment } \\
\text { methodology. }\end{array} \\
\hline \begin{array}{l}\text { 45 C.F.R. § 153.610 - Risk } \\
\text { adjustment issuer requirements. }\end{array} & \begin{array}{l}\text { (a) Data requirements. An issuer that offers risk adjustment } \\
\text { covered plans must submit or make accessible all required risk } \\
\text { adjustment data for those risk adjustment covered plans in } \\
\text { accordance with the risk adjustment data collection approach } \\
\text { established by the State, or by HHS on behalf of the State. }\end{array} \\
\text { (b) Risk adjustment data storage. An issuer that offers risk }\end{array}
$$\right\} $$
\begin{array}{l}\text { adjustment covered plans must store all required risk } \\
\text { adjustment data in accordance with the risk adjustment data } \\
\text { collection approach established by the State, or by HHS on } \\
\text { behalf of the State. }\end{array}
$$\right\} \begin{array}{l}(c) Issuer contracts. An issuer that offers risk adjustment <br>
covered plans may include in its contract with a provider, <br>
supplier, physician, or other practitioner, provisions that require <br>
such contractor's submission of complete and accurate risk <br>
adjustment data in the manner and timeframe established by the <br>
State, or HHS on behalf of the State. These provisions may <br>
include financial penalties for failure to submit complete, <br>

timely, or accurate data.\end{array}\right\}\)| (d) Assessment of charges. An issuer that offers risk |
| :--- |
| adjustment covered plans that has a net balance of risk |$|$

$\left.\left.\begin{array}{|l|l|}\hline \text { Regulation } & \text { Guidance } \\ \hline & \begin{array}{l}\text { adjustment charges payable, including adjustments made } \\ \text { pursuant to § 153.350(c), will be notified by the State, or by } \\ \text { HHS on behalf of the State, of those net charges, and must } \\ \text { remit those risk adjustment charges to the State, or to HHS on } \\ \text { behalf of the State, as applicable. }\end{array} \\ & \begin{array}{l}\text { (e) Charge submission deadline. An issuer must remit net } \\ \text { charges to the State, or HHS on behalf of the State, within 30 } \\ \text { days of notification of net charges payable by the State, or HHS } \\ \text { on behalf of the State. }\end{array} \\ & \begin{array}{l}\text { (f) Assessment and collection of user fees for } \text { HHS risk } \\ \text { adjustment operations. Where HHS is operating risk } \\ \text { adjustment on behalf of a State, an issuer of a risk adjustment } \\ \text { covered plan (other than a student health plan or a plan not } \\ \text { subject to 45 CFR 147.102, 147.104, 147.106, 156.80, and }\end{array} \\ \text { subpart B of part 156) must, for each benefit year - }\end{array}\right\} \begin{array}{l}\text { (1) Submit or make accessible to HHS its monthly enrollment } \\ \text { for the risk adjustment covered plan for the benefit year through } \\ \text { the risk adjustment data collection approach established at § } \\ \text { 153.610(a), in a manner and timeframe specified by HHS; and } \\ \text { (2) Remit to HHS an amount equal to the product of its monthly }\end{array}\right\}$
$\left.\begin{array}{|l|l|}\hline \text { Regulation } & \text { Guidance } \\ \hline & \begin{array}{l}\text { (c) Audits and compliance reviews. HHS or its designee may } \\ \text { audit or conduct a compliance review of an issuer of a risk } \\ \text { adjustment covered plan to assess its compliance with respect to } \\ \text { the applicable requirements in this subpart and subpart H of this } \\ \text { part. Compliance reviews conducted under this section will } \\ \text { follow the standards set forth in § 156.715 of this subchapter. } \\ \text { (1) Notice of audit. HHS will provide at least 30 calendar days } \\ \text { advance notice of its intent to conduct an audit of an issuer of a } \\ \text { risk adjustment covered plan. } \\ \text { (i) Conferences. All audits will include an entrance conference } \\ \text { at which the scope of the audit will be presented and an exit } \\ \text { conference at which the initial audit findings will be discussed. } \\ \text { (2) Compliance with audit activities. To comply with an audit } \\ \text { under this section, the issuer must: } \\ \text { (i) Ensure that its relevant employees, agents, contractors, } \\ \text { subcontractors, downstream entities, and delegated entities } \\ \text { cooperate with any audit or compliance review under this } \\ \text { section; } \\ \text { (ii) Submit complete and accurate data to HHS or its designees } \\ \text { that is necessary to complete the audit, in the format and } \\ \text { manner specified by HHS, no later than 30 calendar days after } \\ \text { the initial audit response deadline established by HHS at the }\end{array} \\ \text { audit entrance conference described in paragraph (c)(1)(i) of } \\ \text { this section for the applicable benefit year; } \\ \text { (iii) Respond to all audit notices, letters, and inquiries, } \\ \text { including requests for supplemental or supporting information, } \\ \text { as requested by HHS, no later than 15 calendar days after the } \\ \text { date of the notice, letter, request, or inquiry; and } \\ \text { (iv) In circumstances in which an issuer cannot provide the } \\ \text { requested data or response to HHS within the timeframes under } \\ \text { paragraphs (c)(2)(ii) or (iii) of this section, as applicable, the } \\ \text { issuer may make a written request for an extension to HHS. The } \\ \text { extension request must be submitted within the timeframe } \\ \text { established under paragraphs (c)(2)(ii) or (iii) of this section, as } \\ \text { applicable, and must detail the reason for the extension request } \\ \text { and the good cause in support of the request. If the extension is } \\ \text { granted, the issuer must respond within the timeframe specified } \\ \text { in HHS's notice granting the extension of time. } \\ \text { (3) Preliminary audit findings. HHS will share its preliminary } \\ \text { audit findings with the issuer, who will then have 30 calendar }\end{array}\right\}$
\(\left.\left.$$
\begin{array}{|l|l|}\hline \text { Regulation } & \text { Guidance } \\
\hline & \begin{array}{l}\text { days to respond to such findings in the format and manner } \\
\text { specified by HHS. } \\
\text { (i) If the issuer does not dispute or otherwise respond to the } \\
\text { preliminary findings, the audit findings will become final. } \\
\text { (ii) If the issuer responds and disputes the preliminary findings, } \\
\text { HHS will review and consider such response and finalize the } \\
\text { audit findings after such review. } \\
\text { (4) Final audit findings. If an audit results in the inclusion of a } \\
\text { finding in the final audit report, the issuer must comply with the } \\
\text { actions set forth in the final audit report in the manner and } \\
\text { timeframe established by HHS, and the issuer must complete all } \\
\text { of the following: } \\
\text { (i) Within 45 calendar days of the issuance of the final audit }\end{array} \\
\text { report, provide a written corrective action plan to HHS for } \\
\text { approval. } \\
\text { (ii) Implement that plan. }\end{array}
$$\right\} \begin{array}{l}(iii) Provide to HHS written documentation of the corrective <br>
actions once taken. <br>
(5) Failure to comply with audit activities. If an issuer fails to <br>
comply with the audit activities set forth in this subsection in <br>
the manner and timeframes specified by HHS: <br>
(i) HHS will notify the issuer of the risk adjustment (including <br>
high-cost risk pool) payments that the issuer has not adequately <br>
substantiated; and <br>

(ii) HHS will notify the issuer that HHS may recoup any risk\end{array}\right\}\)| adjustment (including high-cost risk pool) payments identified |
| :--- |
| in paragraph (c)(5)(i) of this section. |

\(\left.\left.\left.$$
\begin{array}{|l|l|}\hline \text { Regulation } & \text { Guidance } \\
\hline & \begin{array}{l}\text { program, as applicable, must provide to HHS, through the } \\
\text { dedicated data environment, access to enrollee-level plan } \\
\text { enrollment data, enrollee claims data, and enrollee encounter } \\
\text { data as specified by HHS. } \\
\text { (b) Claims data All claims data submitted by an issuer of a risk } \\
\text { adjustment covered plan or a reinsurance-eligible plan in a State } \\
\text { in which HHS is operating the risk adjustment or reinsurance } \\
\text { program, as applicable, must have resulted in payment by the } \\
\text { issuer (or payment of cost sharing by the enrollee). } \\
\text { (c) Claims data from capitated plans. An issuer of a risk } \\
\text { adjustment covered plan or a reinsurance-eligible plan in a State } \\
\text { in which HHS is operating the risk adjustment or reinsurance } \\
\text { program, as applicable, that does not generate individual } \\
\text { enrollee claims in the normal course of business must derive the } \\
\text { costs of all applicable provider encounters using its principal } \\
\text { internal methodology for pricing those encounters. If the issuer } \\
\text { does not have such a methodology, or has an incomplete }\end{array} \\
\text { methodology, it must supplement the methodology in a manner } \\
\text { that yields derived claims that are reasonable in light of the } \\
\text { specific service and insurance market that the plan is serving. }\end{array}
$$\right\} $$
\begin{array}{l}\text { (d) Final dedicated distributed data environment report. } \\
\text { Within 15 calendar days of the date of the final dedicated } \\
\text { distributed data environment report from HHS, the issuer must, } \\
\text { in a format specified by HHS, either: }\end{array}
$$\right\} \begin{array}{l}(1) Confirm to HHS that the information in the final report <br>
accurately reflects the data to which the issuer has provided <br>
access to HHS through its dedicated distributed data <br>
environment in accordance with § 153.700(a) for the benefit <br>

year specified in the report; or\end{array}\right\}\)| (2) Describe to HHS any discrepancy it identifies in the final |
| :--- |
| dedicated distributed data environment report. |

## Appendix 3 - Acronyms

| Terms \& Acronyms | Definition |
| :--- | :--- |
| ACA | Patient Protection and Affordable Care Act |
| BY | Benefit Year |
| CCIIO | Center for Consumer Information and Insurance Oversight |
| CEO | Chief Executive Officer |
| CFO | Chief Financial Officer |
| CFR | Code of Federal Regulations |
| CMS | Centers for Medicare \& Medicaid Services |
| ECM | EDGE Calculation Module |
| EDGE | EDGE Server Business Rules Data Gathering Environment |
| ESBR | Generally Accepted Government Auditing Standards |
| GAGAS | High-Cost Risk Pool |
| HCRP | Department of Health and Human Services |
| HCRPDE | Health Insurance Oversight System |
| HHS | Maximum Out of Pocket |
| HIOS | Qualified Health Plan |
| MOOP | Risk Adjustment |
| RHP |  |

## Appendix 4 - Audit Procedure Description, Criteria, and Effect

$\left.\begin{array}{|l|l|l|l|}\hline \text { Procedure } & \text { Description } & \text { Criteria } & \text { Effect } \\ \hline \begin{array}{l}\text { Unreconciled } \\ \text { Claims } \\ \text { Review }\end{array} & \begin{array}{l}\text { Review and comparison } \\ \text { of the unique claim IDs } \\ \text { included in the issuer's } \\ \text { BY 2018 HCRPDE } \\ \text { Report to the unique } \\ \text { claim IDs included in the } \\ \text { issuer's claims data } \\ \text { extract to determine } \\ \text { existence. }\end{array} & \begin{array}{l}\text { HCRP eligible claims } \\ \text { submitted to the EDGE server } \\ \text { only include claims the issuer } \\ \text { can substantiate in its claims } \\ \text { system. }\end{array} & \begin{array}{l}\text { The inclusion of } \\ \text { unreconciled claims in } \\ \text { the BY 2018 HCRPDE C.F.R. §§ 153.610, } \\ \text { Report result in a change } \\ \text { to the issuer's BY 2018 } \\ \text { HCRP payments. }\end{array} \\ \hline \text { 153.620, 153.700, and } \\ \text { 153.710. See the HCRP } \\ \text { Reference Guide (Version 1.0 } \\ \text { September 1, 2018). }{ }^{26}\end{array}\right]$

[^10]| Procedure | Description | Criteria | Effect |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Paid Claim <br> Amount <br> Validation | Review the issuer's claims in the claims data extract to validate the paid claim amount matches the paid claim amount in the issuer's BY 2018 HCRPDE Report. | HCRP eligible claims submitted to the EDGE server only include the amounts paid by the issuer. <br> See 45 C.F.R. §§ 153.610, 153.620, 153.700, and 153.710. See the HCRP Reference Guide (Version 1.0 September 1, 2018). ${ }^{29}$ | The inclusion of claims with overstated paid claim amounts result in a change to the issuer's BY 2018 HCRP payments and claims with understated paid claim amounts result in an observation and no change to the issuer's BY 2018 HCRP payments. |
| BY 2018 <br> Cross Year <br> Claim <br> Validation | Review the issuer's claims end dates in the claims data extract to validate whether cross year claims fell within BY 2018 and were not from the prior or subsequent BYs. | HCRP eligible claims submitted to the EDGE server only include claims that have a service end date within the applicable BY. <br> See 45 C.F.R. §§ 153.610, 153.620, 153.700, and 153.710. See the 2018 HCRP Reference Guide (Version 1.0 September 1, 2018) ${ }^{30}$ | The inclusion of claims that were reported in the incorrect BY result in a change to the issuer's BY 2018 HCRP payments. |
| Duplicate <br> Claim <br> Validation | Review the issuer's claims in the claims data extract and determine if duplicate claims were reported to the EDGE server. | HCRP eligible claims submitted to the EDGE server only include claims the issuer can substantiate in its claims system and should only be reported one time. <br> See 45 C.F.R. §§ 153.610, 153.620, 153.700, and 153.710. See the 2018 HCRP Reference Guide (Version 1.0 September 1, 2018) ${ }^{31}$ | The inclusion of duplicate claims result in a change to the issuer's BY 2018 HCRP payments. |
| Enrollee Validation | Review and comparison of the unique enrollees and related claims included in the issuer's BY 2018 HCRPDE Report to the unique enrollee IDs and related claims included in the | HCRP eligible claims submitted to the EDGE server should only include claims associated with the appropriate eligible enrollee ID. | The inclusion of claims associated with an enrollee that does not match the enrollee reported to the BY 2018 HCRPDE Report result in a change to the issuer's |

[^11]| Procedure | Description | Criteria | Effect |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | issuer's data claims extract to determine the accuracy of enrollees submitted to the EDGE server. | See 45 C.F.R. §§ 153.610, 153.620, 153.700, and 153.710. See the 2018 HCRP Reference Guide (Version 1.0 September 1, 2018). ${ }^{32}$ | BY 2018 HCRP payments. |
| Premium <br> Effectuation <br> Validation | Review and comparison of the issuer's initial premium payment documentation to the issuer's premium data extract to validate the accuracy of binder payment amount and appropriate effectuation. | Eligible subscriber premiums submitted to the EDGE server only include premiums associated with the current BY. <br> See 45 C.F.R. §§ 153.610, 153.620, 153.700, and 153.710. See the 2018 HCRP Reference Guide (Version 1.0 September 1, 2018). ${ }^{33}$ | The inclusion of subscribers with first month binder payments that were not effectuated and/or contained premium amount differences result in an observation and no change to the issuer's BY 2018 HCRP payments. |
| Premium <br> Amount Validation | Review and comparison of the premium information in the issuer's premium data extract to premium information in the issuer's BY 2018 EDGE Enrollment File to validate the accuracy of the premium data reported to the EDGE server for all months of enrollment. | Eligible subscriber premiums submitted to the EDGE server only include premiums associated with the current BY. <br> See 45 C.F.R. §§ 153.610, 153.620, 153.700, and 153.710. See the 2018 HCRP Reference Guide (Version 1.0 September 1, 2018). ${ }^{34}$ | The inclusion of subscribers with premium amount differences result in an observation and no change to the issuer's BY 2018 HCRP payments. |
| Issuer <br> Policies and Procedures Review | Determine whether the issuer's policies and procedures comply with applicable CMS rules, regulations, and policies related to HCRP. | Issuers should implement policies and procedures that adequately address and document their implementation and compliance with the federal requirements related to HCRP payments and EDGE submission processes. Issuers must maintain documents and records for each benefit year for at least 10 years and must make those documents and records available to | The absence of documentation regarding the issuer's HCRP policies and procedures result in an observation and no change to the issuer's BY 2018 HCRP payments. |

[^12]| Procedure | Description | Criteria | Effect |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
|  |  | substantiate the request for <br> HCRP payments. |  |
|  |  | See 45 C.F.R. § 153.620. |  |


[^0]:    ${ }^{1}$ The ACA (Pub. L. 111-148) was enacted on March 23, 2010. The Health Care and Education Reconciliation Act of 2010 (Pub. L. 111-152), which amended and revised several provisions of the ACA, was enacted on March 30, 2010. In this report, we refer to the two statutes collectively as the "Patient Protection and Affordable Care Act" or "ACA."
    ${ }^{2}$ See 42 U.S.C. § 18063. Also see 45 C.F.R. Part 153, Subparts A, B, D, G, and H. Consistent with section 1321(c)(1) of the ACA, the HHS Secretary is responsible for operating the program on behalf of any State that elected not to do so. See 42 U.S.C. § 18041(c)(1). For the 2018 benefit year, CMS, on behalf of HHS, operated the program in all 50 States and the District of Columbia.
    ${ }^{3}$ HHS added the HCRP to the HHS risk adjustment methodology beginning with the 2018 benefit year. See the HHS Notice of Benefit and Payment Parameters for 2018; Final Rule, 81 FR 94058 at 94080 - 94082 (December 22, 2016).
    ${ }^{4}$ Audit protocols allow for dialogue between auditor and issuer to identify and correct errors in audit data submissions that differ somewhat from some independence and reporting standards set forth under Generally Accepted Government Auditing Standards (GAGAS). These procedures were defined and executed consistent with the competence, integrity, and analytical discipline required for "performance audits" as defined by GAGAS.
    ${ }^{5}$ HCRP payments are funded by a percent of premium charge on all risk adjustment covered plans in the applicable national market risk pool. See 81 FR at $94080-94082$. There are two national market risk pools in the HCRP- one for the individual market (including catastrophic and non-catastrophic plans, and merged market plans), and another for the small group market. Ibid.
    ${ }^{6}$ The final BY 2018 national HCRP payment parameters consisted of a $\$ 1,000,000$ attachment point and a $60 \%$ coinsurance rate. See 81 FR at 94081. Also see Benefit Year 2018 High Cost Risk Pool Reference Guide available at: https://www.hhs.gov/guidance/sites/default/files/hhsguidancedocuments/HCRP IssuerReferenceGuide_100418_v1_5CR_102618.pdf.

[^1]:    ${ }^{7}$ See 45 C.F.R. § 153.730.
    ${ }^{8}$ As communicated in the Entrance Conference, additional HCRP payments will not be provided for underpayments identified as a result of the BY 2018 HCRP Audits. In addition, HCRP charges will not be recalculated as a result of any premium discrepancies identified in these audits. However, HHS may recalculate HCRP charges as part of other audits or enforcement actions.

[^2]:    ${ }^{9}$ The HCRP calculations under the HHS RA methodology involve two national risk pools - one for the individual market (including catastrophic and non-catastrophic plans, and merged market plans), and another for the small group market. See 81 FR at 94080-94082.
    ${ }^{10}$ Please refer to Section II C. Findings to view the aggregated amount of paid claim differences associated with each audit procedure, used for calculating the "Total Financial Impact."
    ${ }^{11}$ See 45 C.F.R. $\S \S 156.1210$ and 156.1215 . If all or part of the recoupment amount is unable to be netted, the remaining amount will be a determination of a debt that is owed to the federal government. See 45 C.F.R. § 156.1215(c). In such circumstances, CMS will send an invoice to the issuer for the remaining amount to collect the debt.
    ${ }^{12}$ Additional HCRP payments will not be provided for underpayments identified as a result of the BY 2018 HCRP audits.

[^3]:    ${ }^{13}$ See 45 C.F.R. § 153.620(c).
    ${ }^{14}$ See supra note 3 .
    ${ }^{15} 81$ FR at 94080-94082.
    ${ }^{16}$ See 81 FR at 94081.
    ${ }^{17}$ See 45 C.F.R. §§ 153.610(a) and 153.700.
    ${ }^{18}$ See supra note 7 .

[^4]:    ${ }^{19}$ The HCRPDE report contains issuer, market, enrollee-level plan, and claim details used for the HCRP payment calculations and is made available only to issuers through EDGE servers.
    ${ }^{20}$ Issuer EDGE servers process enrollment and claims data according to the EDGE Server Business Rules (ESBR) to select claims to be included in RA transfer calculations, including HCRP payment and charge calculations. See 45 C.F.R. §§ 153.610, 153.620, 153.700, 153.710, and 153.720.

[^5]:    ${ }^{21}$ Please see Appendix 4 for more information on each procedure's description, criteria, and effect.

[^6]:    ${ }^{22}$ This review primarily focused on the BY 2018 HCRPDE Report titled:
    21663.HCRPDE.D20190501T020632.P.csv.

[^7]:    ${ }^{23}$ In BY 2018, the HCRP payment calculations did not include a CSR MOOP adjustment because HHS ceased making CSR payments in October 2017. See Op. Att'y Gen. (October 12, 2017), discussing United States House of Representatives v. Burwell, 185 F. Supp. 3d 165, 174 (D.D.C. 2016), which declared CSR payments by HHS impermissible absent an explicit congressional appropriation. Available at
    https://www.hhs.gov/sites/default/files/csr-payment-memo.pdf.

[^8]:    ${ }^{24}$ Financial impact derived from BY 2018 HCRP Program audits only includes findings where funds are subject to recoupment by HHS. These amounts will be collected as part of the next available monthly payment cycle consistent with 45 C.F.R. § 156.1210 and the netting regulation at 45 C.F.R. § 156.1215 after this report is finalized. If all or part of the recoupment amount is unable to be netted, the remaining amount is a determination of a debt that is owed to the federal government. 45 C.F.R. § 156.1215(c).

[^9]:    ${ }^{25}$ https://www.cms.gov/CCIIO/Resources/Forms-Reports-and-Other-Resources/Exams_Audits_Reviews_Issuer_Resources-.

[^10]:    ${ }^{26} \mathrm{https}: / / \mathrm{www} . h \mathrm{hs} . g o v /$ guidance/sites/default/files/hhs-guidancedocuments/HCRP_IssuerReferenceGuide_100418_v1_5CR_102618.pdf.
    ${ }^{27}$ See supra note 26.
    ${ }^{28}$ See supra note 26.

[^11]:    ${ }^{29}$ See supra note 26.
    ${ }^{30}$ See supra note 26.
    ${ }^{31}$ See supra note 26.

[^12]:    ${ }^{32}$ See supra note 26.
    ${ }^{33}$ See supra note 26.
    ${ }^{34}$ See supra note 26.

